Corfu2024: Workshop on Noncommutative and Generalized Geometry in String theory, Gauge theory and Related Physical Models

# Noncommutative gravity and spacetime perturbations

Based on : PLB 854 (2024) 138716, JHEP 06 (2024) 130 and arXiv:2409.01402 with Nikola Herceg, Tajron Jurić, Andjelo Samsarov, Ivica Smolić

#### Naveena Kumara A.

September 23, 2024

Rudjer Bošković Institute, Zagreb, Croatia



- 1. Black hole perturbations
- 2. Noncommutative differential geometry
- 3. Noncommutative gravitational perturbations

# **Black hole perturbations**

#### **Croatian Science Foundation research project**

Search for Quantum Spacetime in Black Hole QNM Spectrum and Gamma Ray Bursts

The aim of this project is to investigate the QNMs resulting from perturbations of realistic 4-dimensional black holes in the presence of quantized spacetime.



Compact Binary Coalescence, relevant to quantum effects in spacetime (arXiv:1610.03567)

# Black Hole Perturbations and Quasinormal Modes (QNM)

- QNM frequency:  $\omega = \omega_R + i\omega_I$ .  $\omega_R$ : oscillation frequency;  $\omega_I$ : damping rate.
- QNMs depend only on black hole parameters ( "footprints" of a black hole).
- Schwarzschild black holes (Regge & Wheeler): linearised Einstein equations → Schrödinger-like equation.



Vibrating string analogy

Wave Equation for Perturbations  $\frac{\partial^2 y}{\partial t^2} - v^2 \frac{\partial^2 y}{\partial x^2} = 0, \quad y(t,0) = y(t,L) = 0, \quad f_n = \frac{nv}{2L}$ Discrete frequencies depend on system length (L) and wave speed (v).

# Black Hole Perturbations: Approach and Boundary Conditions

#### Approach to BH Perturbations:

- Compute equations of motion for perturbations.
- Cast into a wave propagation equation.
- Derive boundary conditions.
- Perform numerical computation.

#### **Boundary Conditions:**

- At event horizon (r = r<sub>H</sub>): impose ingoing conditions: h ∼ e<sup>-i(ωt+kr)</sup>.
- At infinity (r = ∞): impose outgoing conditions: h ~ e<sup>-i(ωt-kr)</sup>.

#### **Key Differences:**

Guitar String :: BH Perturbations Self-adjoint :: Not self-adjoint Real B.C. :: Complex B.C.

#### **Outcome:**

BH perturbations yield damped/exponentially growing sinusoids, indicating energy loss toward the horizon and infinity.

# Metric Perturbations and Axial Modes

- Black hole metric:  $g_{\mu
  u} o g_{\mu
  u} + h_{\mu
  u}$ , with  $h_{\mu
  u}$  being the perturbation.
- Schwarzschild background:  $ds^2 = -\left(1 \frac{2M}{r}\right)dt^2 + \left(1 \frac{2M}{r}\right)^{-1}dr^2 + r^2d\Omega^2$
- $h_{\mu\nu}$  decomposed into spherical harmonics  $Y_{\ell m}$ ; axial (odd-parity) and polar (even-parity) modes are treated separately.
- Time dependence handled via Fourier modes:  $F(t,r) = \int d\omega \tilde{F}(\omega,r) e^{-i\omega t}$ .

#### Gauge and Axial Modes:

- Gauge freedom arises from diffeomorphism invariance:  $h_{\mu\nu} \rightarrow h_{\mu\nu} + \nabla_{\mu}\xi_{\nu} + \nabla_{\nu}\xi_{\mu}$ .
- Regge-Wheeler gauge used for axial modes.
- Axial perturbations for  $\ell \geq 2$  parameterized by  $h_0^{\ell m}$ ,  $h_1^{\ell m}$ , and  $h_2^{\ell m}$ .

#### Key Equations:

- $h_{t\theta} \propto h_0^{\ell m} \partial_{\varphi} Y_{\ell m}$
- $h_{r\theta} \propto h_1^{\ell m} \partial_{\varphi} Y_{\ell m}$
- $h_{t\varphi} \propto h_0^{\ell m} \partial_\theta Y_{\ell m}$
- $h_{r\varphi} \propto h_1^{\ell m} \partial_{\theta} Y_{\ell m}$

#### Schrödinger-like Equation and Effective Potential

#### **Effective Potential:**

#### Perturbation Equation:

$$V_{\text{odd}}(r) = \left(1 - \frac{R}{r}\right) \frac{2(\lambda+1)r - 3R}{r^3}$$

$$\frac{dY}{dr} = M(r)Y, \quad M(r) = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{2}{r} & 2i\lambda\frac{r-R}{r^3} - i\omega^2\\ -i\frac{r^2}{(r-R)^2} & -\frac{R}{r(r-R)} \end{pmatrix}$$
  
where  $Y = {}^{T}(h_0(r), h_1(r)/\omega).$   
Schrodinger-like equation:

$$rac{d^2 \hat{Y}_1}{dr_*^2} + (\omega^2 - V(r)) \hat{Y}_1 = 0$$

Tortoise Coordinate:

$$r_* = r + R \ln \left(\frac{r}{R} - 1\right)$$



Effective potential for gravitational perturbations. 6

# Noncommutative differential geometry

# Lie Algebra, Hopf Algebra, and Drinfeld Twist

### Lie Algebra and Hopf Algebra:

- Lie algebra of vector fields (Ξ, [·, ·]): describes infinitesimal diffeomorphisms of *M*.
- Universal enveloping algebra UΞ encodes Leibniz rule, inverse, and normalization via Δ (coproduct), S (antipode), ε (counit).
- Hopf algebra structure:  $H = (U\Xi, \mu, \Delta, \epsilon, S)$ .
- Hopf algebra conditions:

$$\begin{split} (\Delta \otimes \mathsf{id}) \Delta(\xi) &= (\mathsf{id} \otimes \Delta) \Delta(\xi) \\ (\epsilon \otimes \mathsf{id}) \Delta(\xi) &= \xi = (\mathsf{id} \otimes \epsilon) \Delta(\xi) \\ \mu((S \otimes \mathsf{id}) \Delta(\xi)) &= \epsilon(\xi) 1 \end{split}$$

#### **Drinfeld Twist and** *R*-**Matrix:**

- Drinfeld twist *F* ∈ *H* ⊗ *H*: deforms the Hopf algebra.
- Deformed Hopf algebra:

 $\Delta^{\mathcal{F}}(\xi) = \mathcal{F}\Delta(\xi)\mathcal{F}^{-1}, \quad S^{\mathcal{F}}(\xi) = \chi S(\xi)\chi^{-1}$ 

Universal *R*-matrix relates the deformed coproduct to its coopposite:

 $(\Delta^{\mathcal{F}})^{\mathsf{cop}}(\xi) = R\Delta^{\mathcal{F}}(\xi)R^{-1}$ 

where  $R = \mathcal{F}_{21}\mathcal{F}^{-1}$ .

#### Noncommutative Space:

 The deformed Hopf algebra H<sup>F</sup> is not cocommutative, leading to NC structures on spaces, like the algebra of functions on M.

#### Moyal-Weyl Twist:

- We use the Moyal-Weyl twist  $\mathcal{F}$  on  $\mathcal{M} = \mathbb{R}^N$ .
- The twist is given by:

$$\mathcal{F} = \exp\left(-\frac{ia}{2}\Theta^{\mu\nu}\partial_{\mu}\otimes\partial_{\nu}\right)$$

where  $\Theta^{\mu\nu}$  is antisymmetric.

#### **\*-Product:**

- The algebra of smooth functions C<sup>∞</sup>(M) with pointwise multiplication h(x)k(x) becomes A<sup>\*</sup> = (C<sup>∞</sup>(M), \*).
- The  $\star$ -product for the Moyal-Weyl twist is:

$$h \star k = h e^{\frac{ia}{2} \overleftarrow{\partial}_{\mu} \Theta^{\mu\nu} \overrightarrow{\partial}_{\nu}} k$$

•  $\mathcal{A}^{\star}$  is *R*-symmetric:

 $h\star k=ar{R}^lpha(k)\starar{R}_lpha(h)$ 

### NC Geometry: Covariant Derivatives, Torsion, and Curvature

★-Covariant Derivative: A ★-covariant derivative ∇\* along v ∈ Ξ is a C-linear map satisfying:

$$\nabla_{\nu+w}^{\star} z = \nabla_{\nu}^{\star} z + \nabla_{w}^{\star} z,$$
  

$$\nabla_{h\star\nu}^{\star} z = h \star \nabla_{\nu}^{\star} z,$$
  

$$\nabla_{\nu}^{\star} (h \star z) = \pounds_{\nu}^{\star} (h) \star z + \bar{R}^{\alpha} (h) \star \nabla_{\bar{R}_{\alpha}(\nu)}^{\star} z$$

• **\*-Torsion and Curvature:** Given  $\nabla^*$ , the \*-torsion  $T^*$  and \*-curvature  $R^*$  are:

$$T^{\star}(v,w) = \nabla_{v}^{\star}w - \nabla_{\bar{R}^{\alpha}(w)}^{\star}\bar{R}_{\alpha}(v) - [v,w]_{\star},$$
$$R^{\star}(v,w,z) = \nabla_{v}^{\star}\nabla_{w}^{\star}z - \nabla_{\bar{R}^{\alpha}(w)}^{\star}\nabla_{\bar{R}_{\alpha}(v)}^{\star}z - \nabla_{[v,w]_{\star}}^{\star}z$$

• \*-Ricci Tensor: In the \*-dual basis  $\langle \partial_{\mu}, dx^{\nu} \rangle_{\star} = \delta^{\nu}_{\mu}$ , the \*-Ricci tensor is:

$$R^{\star}(v,w) = \langle dx^{\mu}, R^{\star}(\partial_{\mu},v,w) 
angle_{\star}$$

The noncommutative Ricci tensor is not R-symmetric, as the Riemann tensor is not R-antisymmetric in its last two indices.

# NC Geometry: Moyal-Weyl Twist, Torsion, Curvature, and Inverse Metric

 Moyal-Weyl Twist: The \*-covariant derivative, torsion, curvature, and Ricci tensor are given by:

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla^{\star}_{\partial_{\mu}}\partial_{\nu} =& \Gamma^{\star\rho}_{\mu\nu} \star \partial_{\rho} = \Gamma^{\star\rho}_{\mu\nu}\partial_{\rho} \\ T^{\star}(\partial_{\mu},\partial_{\nu}) = \left(\Gamma^{\star\rho}_{\mu\nu} - \Gamma^{\star\rho}_{\nu\mu}\right)\partial_{\rho}, \\ R^{\star}(\partial_{\mu},\partial_{\nu},\partial_{\rho}) = \left(\partial_{\mu}\Gamma^{\star\sigma}_{\nu\rho} - \partial_{\nu}\Gamma^{\star\sigma}_{\mu\rho} + \Gamma^{\star\tau}_{\nu\rho} \star \Gamma^{\star\sigma}_{\mu\tau} - \Gamma^{\star\tau}_{\mu\rho} \star \Gamma^{\star\sigma}_{\nu\tau}\right)\partial_{\sigma}, \\ R^{\star}(\partial_{\nu},\partial_{\rho}) =& \partial_{\mu}\Gamma^{\star\mu}_{\nu\rho} - \partial_{\nu}\Gamma^{\star\mu}_{\mu\rho} + \Gamma^{\star\tau}_{\nu\rho} \star \Gamma^{\star\mu}_{\mu\tau} - \Gamma^{\star\tau}_{\mu\rho} \star \Gamma^{\star\mu}_{\nu\tau}. \end{aligned}$$

• Inverse Metric: The metric and inverse metric satisfy:

$$g_{\mu\nu} \star g^{\nu\rho} = \delta^{\rho}_{\mu}, \quad g^{\mu\nu} \star g_{\nu\rho} = \delta^{\mu}_{\rho}$$

The inverse metric is:

$$g^{\starlphaeta}=g^{lphaeta}-g^{\gammaeta}\Theta^{\mu
u}(\partial_{\mu}g^{lpha\sigma})(\partial_{
u}g_{\sigma\gamma})+\mathcal{O}(a^{2})$$

• Levi-Civita Connection: The Levi-Civita connection is:

$$\Gamma^{\star\rho}_{\mu\nu} = \frac{1}{2} g^{\star\rho\sigma} \star (\partial_{\mu} g_{\nu\sigma} + \partial_{\nu} g_{\mu\sigma} - \partial_{\sigma} g_{\mu\nu})$$

Noncommutative gravitational perturbations

# Non-commutative Einstein Manifolds and R-Symmetrization

- In commutative gravity, black hole perturbations use  $R_{\mu\nu} = 0$ .
- In non-commutative gravity, the analogous condition is  $\mathcal{R}_{\mu\nu} = 0$ .

• Ensuring  $R_{\mu\nu}^{\star} = 0$  is non-trivial due to the

**R-symmetrized Ricci tensor** 

non-symmetry of  $R^{\star}_{\mu\nu}$ .

• For Moyal-Weyl type deformations, *R*-symmetrization is:

$${\cal R}_{\mu
u}={\it R}^{\star}_{(\mu
u)}=rac{1}{2}({\it R}^{\star}_{\mu
u}+{\it R}^{\star}_{
u\mu})$$

$$\mathcal{R}_{\mu
u} \equiv rac{1}{2} \left\langle dx^{lpha}, R^{\star}(\partial_{lpha}, \partial_{\mu}, \partial_{
u}) + R^{\star}(\partial_{lpha}, ar{R}^{A}(\partial_{
u}), ar{R}_{A}(\partial_{\mu})) 
ight
angle_{\star}$$

A generalized abelian twist is:

$${\cal F} = \exp\left(-rac{ia}{2}\Theta^{\mu
u}X_\mu\otimes X_
u
ight)$$

#### Selection of a Specific Twist:

- Twist selection in quantum gravity should ideally be guided by experiments, but in their absence, symmetry arguments provide guidance.
- A twist constructed from Killing vectors K<sup>μ</sup> of the background g<sub>μν</sub> does not produce nontrivial NC effects since £<sub>K</sub>g = 0. The same applies to semi-Killing twists with K<sup>μ</sup> and arbitrary vector V<sup>ν</sup>.

#### Semi-pseudo-Killing Twist:

- In black hole perturbation studies
   (g<sub>μν</sub> + h<sub>μν</sub>), a Killing twist results in NC
   corrections that are quadratic in h, as
   £<sub>K</sub>g = 0 but £<sub>K</sub>h ≠ 0.
- A semi-pseudo-Killing twist, constructed from Killing vector K<sup>μ</sup> and arbitrary vector X<sup>ν</sup>, yields leading linearized NC perturbation terms.

# Semi-pseudo-Killing Twist

#### Twist Form and Killing Fields:

 The semi-pseudo-Killing twist is defined as:

$$\mathcal{F} = e^{-irac{\partial}{2}\left(K\otimes X - X\otimes K
ight)}$$

 The background has two Killing fields K<sub>t</sub> and K<sub>φ</sub>. We choose:

 $K = \alpha \partial_t + \beta \partial_\varphi, \quad X = \partial_r$ 

• The resulting commutation relations:

 $[t , r] = ia\alpha, \quad [\varphi , r] = ia\beta$ 

#### **Eigenvalue and** \*-**Product:**

 The parameter \u03c6 is the eigenvalue of the Killing field's action on the perturbation:

$$h_{\mu
u} \propto e^{-i\omega t} e^{im\varphi}, \quad \pounds_{\kappa} h_{\mu
u} = i\lambda h_{\mu
u},$$

$$\lambda = -\alpha\omega + \beta m$$

The linearized \*-product is:

 $h \star k = hk + \frac{i}{2}a[K(h)X(k) - X(h)K(k)]$ 

Where 
$$X(k) \equiv \mathcal{L}(k)$$
.

# Zerilli Gauge and Linearized Einstein Equations

 Zerilli Gauge: In polar perturbations, the metric is parameterized by four functions in the Zerilli gauge: H<sup>ℓm</sup><sub>0</sub>, H<sup>ℓm</sup><sub>1</sub>, H<sup>ℓm</sup><sub>2</sub>, and K<sup>ℓm</sup>:

$$h_{tt} = A(r) \sum_{\ell,m} H_0^{\ell m}(t,r) Y_{\ell m}(\theta,\varphi), \quad h_{tr} = \sum_{\ell,m} H_1^{\ell m}(t,r) Y_{\ell m}(\theta,\varphi),$$
$$h_{rr} = \frac{1}{A(r)} \sum_{\ell,m} H_2^{\ell m}(t,r) Y_{\ell m}(\theta,\varphi), \quad h_{ab} = \sum_{\ell,m} K^{\ell m}(t,r) g_{ab} Y_{\ell m}(\theta,\varphi),$$

where A(r) = 1 - R/r and a, b denote angular coordinates.

• Linearized Einstein Equations: The equations of motion, up to linear order in perturbation  $h_{\mu\nu}$  and NC deformation *a*, yield coupled PDEs for  $H_0$ ,  $H_1$ ,  $H_2$ , and *K*. Using  $R = H_1/\omega$ , the linearized Einstein equations reduce to:

$$K' = \left[\alpha_0(r) + \alpha_2(r)\omega^2\right] K + \left[\beta_0(r) + \beta_2(r)\omega^2\right] R,$$
  

$$R' = \left[\gamma_0(r) + \gamma_2(r)\omega^2\right] K + \left[\delta_0(r) + \delta_2(r)\omega^2\right] R$$

where  $\alpha(r)$ ,  $\beta(r)$ ,  $\gamma(r)$ , and  $\delta(r)$  are complicated functions of r.

# Linearized Einstein Equations and Schrödinger-Like Form

• We introduce the field redefinition:

$$K = \hat{f}(r)\hat{K} + \hat{g}(r)\hat{R}, \quad R = \hat{h}(r)\hat{K} + \hat{l}(r)\hat{R}$$

with the coordinate transformation  $dr/d\hat{r}^* = \hat{n}(r).$ 

• The requirement:

$$rac{d\hat{K}}{d\hat{r}^*}=\hat{R}, \quad rac{d\hat{R}}{d\hat{r}^*}=(V-\omega^2)\hat{K}$$

leads to the Schrödinger-like equation:

$$\frac{d^2\hat{K}}{d\hat{r}^{*2}} + (\omega^2 - V)\hat{K} = 0.$$

#### **Coupled ODEs and Constraints:**

• A generic transformation results in coupled ODEs:

$$\hat{K}' = \left[\hat{lpha}_0(r) + \hat{lpha}_2(r)\omega^2\right]\hat{K} + \left[\hat{eta}_0(r) + \hat{eta}_2(r)\omega^2\right]\hat{R},$$

$$\hat{R}' = \left[\hat{\gamma}_0(r) + \hat{\gamma}_2(r)\omega^2\right]\hat{K} + \left[\hat{\delta}_0(r) + \hat{\delta}_2(r)\omega^2\right]\hat{R}.$$

Constraints:

$$\hatlpha_0(r)=\hatlpha_2(r)=\hateta_2(r)=\hat\delta_0(r)=\hat\delta_2(r)=0,$$

$$\hat{\beta}_0(r) = 1, \quad \hat{\gamma}_2(r) = -1.$$

- Seven conditions for five unknowns  $(\hat{f}(r), \hat{g}(r), \hat{h}(r), \hat{l}(r), \hat{n}(r))$  allow the system to admit a solution.

#### Non-commutative Solutions and Zerilli Potential

• The solutions to the required field redefinition are:

$$\hat{f}(r) = f(r) + \lambda \tilde{a}f(r), \quad \hat{g}(r) = g(r) + \lambda \tilde{g}(r),$$
  

$$\hat{h}(r) = h(r) + \lambda \tilde{a}h(r), \quad \hat{l}(r) = l(r) + \lambda \tilde{a}l(r),$$

where the terms with tildes are the non-commutative corrections.

• The tortoise coordinate is:

$$\hat{n}(r) = \frac{r}{r-R} - \lambda a \frac{4r^2 + 2\Lambda rR + 3R^2}{2(r-R)^2(2\Lambda r + 3R)}$$

• The effective potential is  $V = V_{\rm Z} + V_{\rm NC}$ , where:

$$V_{\rm Z} = \frac{(r-R)\left(8\Lambda^2(\Lambda+1)r^3 + 12\Lambda^2r^2R + 18\Lambda rR^2 + 9R^3\right)}{r^4(2\Lambda r + 3R)^2}$$
$$V_{\rm NC} = \frac{\lambda a}{4r^5(2\Lambda r + 3R)^3}\left[-32\Lambda^2(2\Lambda^2 + 7)r^5 + \dots + 387R^5\right]$$

(NC potential abbreviated.)

#### Non-commutative potentials



Left: NC Regge-Wheeler potential. Right: NC Zerilli potential

# QNM using higher order WKB method



The comparison between the noncommutative correction  $\Delta_c$  and the relative error  $\Delta_k$  in the optimal WKB order is illustrated. Left: Axial case. Right: Polar case.

The WKB QNM formulaWKB error formulaNC correction  $\Delta_c$  $\frac{i(\omega^2 - V_0)}{\sqrt{-2V_0''}} - \sum_{i=2}^6 \tilde{\Lambda}_i = n + \frac{1}{2}$  $\Delta_k = \frac{|\omega_{k+1} - \omega_{k-1}|}{2},$  $\Delta_c = |\omega_{NC} - \omega_C|.$ 

am	WKB	Order	Pöschl-Teller	Rosen-Morse
-0.2	0.3775(61) - 0.0883(97) i	6	0.382049 - 0.090320 i	0.38335 - 0.08924 i
-0.1	0.3755(14) - 0.0887(70) i	6	0.380114 - 0.090466 i	0.38057 - 0.09008 i
-0.01	0.3738(07) - 0.0888(92) i	6	0.378454 - 0.090521 i	0.37855 - 0.09044 i
-0.001	0.3736(38) - 0.0888(91) i	6	0.378294 - 0.090520 i	0.37838 - 0.09044 i
0	0.3736(19) - 0.0888(91) i	6	0.378276 - 0.090520 i	0.37837 - 0.09044 i
0.001	0.3736(01) - 0.0888(91) i	6	0.378258 - 0.090520 i	0.37838 - 0.09042 i
0.01	0.3734(33) - 0.0888(88) i	6	0.378099 - 0.090518 i	0.37836 - 0.09030 i
0.1	0.3715(87) - 0.0889(38) i	4	0.376562 - 0.090455 i	0.37756 - 0.08961 i
0.2	0.36(8345) - 0.08(8195) i	4	0.375007 - 0.090238 i	0.37611 - 0.08930 i

**Table 1:** NC axial QNMs for n = 0, M = 1 (R = 2), and  $\ell = 2$ . To convert frequencies to kHz, multiply by  $2\pi \times 5142 \text{ Hz} \times (M_{\odot}/M)$ . For a  $10M_{\odot}$  black hole,  $M\omega \approx (0.37, -0.09)$  corresponds to 1.2 kHz and a damping time of 0.55 ms. LIGO detects frequencies from 10 Hz to 10 kHz.

am	WKB	Order	Pöschl-Teller	Rosen-Morse
-0.2	0.3(80198) - 0.0(83646) i	3	0.382642 - 0.097531 i	0.38379 - 0.09648 i
-0.1	0.37(4735) - 0.09(1148) i	4	0.380292 - 0.093609 i	0.38178 - 0.09230 i
-0.01	0.3738(64) - 0.0892(07) i	5	0.378475 - 0.090866 i	0.37890 - 0.09050 i
-0.001	0.3736(58) - 0.0889(67) i	5	0.378308 - 0.090622 i	0.37845 - 0.09050 i
0	0.3736(36) - 0.0889(40) i	5	0.378290 - 0.090595 i	0.37839 - 0.09051 i
0.001	0.3736(13) - 0.0889(14) i	5	0.378272 - 0.090567 i	0.37836 - 0.09049 i
0.01	0.3734(13) - 0.0886(75) i	5	0.378109 - 0.090322 i	0.37821 - 0.09023 i
0.1	0.3718(88) - 0.0861(75) i	6	0.376612 - 0.088102 i	0.37741 - 0.08744 i
0.2	0.3711(29) - 0.0836(58) i	7	0.375215 - 0.085959 i	0.37794 - 0.08379 i

**Table 2:** Table of NC polar QNMs for n = 0, M = 1, and  $\ell = 2$ .

# **Isospectral Breaking**



Isospectrality breaking due to noncommutativity for  $\ell = 2$ . Parameters: n = 0, M = 1 (R = 2). Values chosen correspond to optimal WKB order.

Relative deviation, 
$$\Delta \omega_{R,I} = 100 imes rac{\omega_{R,I}^{axial} - \omega_{R,I}^{polar}}{\omega_{R,I}^{polar}}.$$

- Perturbations of Spinning Black Holes
  - Teukolsky Approach: Using the Newman-Penrose formalism
  - Slow Rotating Approximation
- Cosmological Perturbations
- Perturbations of Charged Black Holes
- Generalization to Different Twists

# **Thank You!**

